



# Linguistic Parallelism in “La Belle Dame Sans Mercy” by John Keats and Urdu Poem “Husan ki Divy” by Shevan Rizvi

Shaukat Khan (Corresponding author)

English Language Institute, Faculty of Social Sciences, Umm Al-Qura University, Abediya Campus, Makkah (21955), Saudi Arabia

E-mail: littlescholar\_sk@yahoo.com

Ajmal Khan

English Language Institute, Faculty of Social Sciences, Umm Al-Qura University, Abediya Campus, Makkah (21955), Saudi Arabia

E-mail: ajmal\_bazmi@yahoo.com

Abdul Majeed Al-Tayib Umar

English Language Institute, Faculty of Social Sciences, Umm Al-Qura University, Abediya Campus, Makkah (21955), Saudi Arabia

E-mail: drtayib@hotmail.com

Received: 01-12-2015

Accepted: 08-02-2016

Advance Access Published: March 2016

Published: 01-05-2016

doi:10.7575/aiac.ijalel.v.5n.3p.121

URL: <http://dx.doi.org/10.7575/aiac.ijalel.v.5n.3p.121>

## Abstract

Linguistic parallelism, the tendency of using similar forms together within a continuous discourse, is a very strong linguistic phenomenon in literature. Linguistic parallelism means the repetition of a syntactic construction in successive sentences for rhetorical effect. In Linguistics parallelism means the use of parallel or similar syntactical structure in a text. Parallelism can be practiced at different levels, i.e. from word to the sentence level. It is common in many languages around the globe. This research work demonstrates that “La Belle Dam Sans Merci” by John Keats and “Husan ki Divy” by Shevan Rizvi exhibit more similarities than differences with regard to this constraint. These two products of literary genius exhibit thematic affinity and formal congruity despite their production in regions separated by miles of land and water, in cultures lacking any shared values, and in languages having no common ancestry. This paper presents linguistic analysis of the two poems in terms of intra textual analysis of the English poem, intra textual analysis of the Urdu poem, and a comparative analysis of both the poems.

**Keywords:** Linguistic parallelism, Stylistics, John Keats, Shevan Rizvi, Poetry

## 1. Introduction

There is a paucity of studies in the comparative analysis of poetry in Urdu and English. The present study embodies an attempt that focuses on a comparative analysis of John Keats’ poem, “La Belle Dame Sans Mercy” and Shevan Rizvi’s Urdu poem “Husan ki Divy”, with particular focus on linguistic parallelism. The two poems not only exhibit stylistic equivalence, i.e. they are written in the same style and manner, they also bear thematic unity. They are written in different times; the first one is in the early nineteenth century and the second one is in the late nineteenth century. The first one is written by a romantic poet John Keats in English while the second one is authored by a Pakistani poet Shevan Rizvi in Urdu. English is an important Germanic language while Urdu comes from the Indo-European family of languages. As such languages are different in phonological make ups, syntactical combinations, semantic organizations, pragmatic derivations and discourse patterns. The poems, however, are stylistically very identical in terms of linguistic parallelism. In these two languages, word to word translation from one language into the other is not possible. It is not the objective of this study to make a word for word translation of both the poems because both are governed by different sets of rules. Rather the prime objective is to make a comparative analysis of these poems in terms of morphological make ups and syntactical organizations and their possible bearing on the thematic unity in them.

### 1.1 Hypotheses

The researchers aim to demonstrate that “La Belle Dam Sans Merci” by John Keats and “Husan ki Divy” by Shevan Rizvi exhibit more similarities than differences with regard to linguistic parallelism at word and phrase level. These two products of literary genius can exhibit thematic affinity and formal congruity despite their production in regions separated by miles of land and water, in cultures lacking any shared values, and in languages having no common ancestry.

### 1.2 Linguistic Parallelism

Linguistic parallelism refers to the repetition of a syntactic construction in successive sentences for rhetorical effect. In Linguistics parallelism means the use of parallel or similar syntactical structure in a text. Parallelism can be practiced at different levels, i.e. from word to the sentence level. It is simply the repetition of similar constructions while writing and speaking. It is a common feature of rhetorical speech and literary writings. According to Anderson (1992 & 2006)

'Structural Analogy' implies that to all things being equal, linguistic components and levels have similar structural properties.

### 1.3 Literature Review

Language used in literature is deviant from the normal mode of communication in certain ways. Literary writers are more concerned with their contents rather than their structure. They play upon words, basic patterns, and models of language usage in order to derive certain motives. This notion not only exempt literary persona from all language constraints, rather give them free hand to exercise their own construction. This belief is aptly addressed by the language analysts. Halliday (1996) maintains that:

Linguistics is not and will never be the whole of literary analysis, and only the literary analyst, not the linguist, can determine the place of linguistics in literary studies. But if a text is to be described at all, then it should be described properly; and this means by the theories and methods developed in linguistics, the subject whose task is precisely to show how language works. (p. 67)

This concept not only creates space for the language theories and models to be followed but also accommodate the due role of linguists in the study of literature. Halliday's view seems more open and wider. As such the following language analysts directed their attention to a more focused analysis. In this regard Thorne (1970) believes one can find in poems features that are irregular with reference to the code but regular within the context of the poem. It is, therefore, proposed that each poem may be regarded as a different language or dialect which requires a separate grammar (p. 29). Thorne's proposed conception led to new ways for the free practice of literary composites by introducing the concept of code and language reference.

Linguistic parallelism in words, phrases and sentence patterns within the same language in different literary writers is a common linguistic phenomenon. It has attracted the attention of many scholars in recent times. Linguistic parallelism, which is the tendency of using similar forms together within a continuous discourse, has been discussed from different perspectives. According to Sankoff (1978), for instance, linguistic parallelism works on several levels: discourse, clause phrase and word level. Kiparsky (1978) notes that parallelism between the two developments as well as between the criteria were developed to distinguish lexical from post-lexical rules in phonology. Kiparsky, however, tries to put the broader horizons of Linguistic parallelism in the narrow compass of phonology.

To Fish (1981, p. 53) Stylistics was established in reaction to the "subjectivity and imprecision of literary studies". For the appreciate raptures of the impressionistic critic, stylisticians purport to "substitute precise and rigorous linguistic descriptions to interpretations for which they can claim a measure of objectivity." In this regard Widdowson (1988) posits that "the character of literature is that the language of a literary work should be fashioned into patterns over and above those required by the actual language system" (p.47). He further purports that the object of this patterning is to create acts of communication which are self-contained units, independent of a social context and expressive of a reality other than that which is sanctioned by convention. Here Widdowson goes too liberal and claims unconstrained freedom to the literary compositions of all language rules regulations. However, the literary language does not correspond to normal mode of communication and is deviant from the normal language patterns. In literary writing "one constantly comes across sentences which would not be generated by an English grammar but which are nevertheless interpretable" Widdowson (1988, p.14). He further maintains that "poets cannot simply ignore the normal meanings of words and invent entirely new meanings at will since they are using a language code which already exists and upon which they depend for communication". Contrary to Widdowson, Fowler (1996) reconsidered the language norms to be followed in literature by correlating literature with society communicative principles. According to Fowler (1996), "literary texts do speak and participate in society's communicative principles, and are important in influencing world view and social structure" (p. 130). Thus, it is for the reader of the text as a participant in the writer's discourse patterns to interpret, analyse and understand text of literature on the basis of linguistic models. It constitutes the triangulation among the writer, his writings and his reader to read and understand him in the same medium in which he expressed his deeply felt thoughts.

Simpson (1997, p. 4) makes a worthwhile comment in this regard:

Part of the stylistic remit is to banish the imprecision, speculations and flights of fancy that have characterized much traditional practical criticism. The aim instead is to arrive at a consensus about a text based on a principled and systematic study procedure. Part of this study procedure involves the use of descriptive models of language that are retrievable and accessible to other students of stylistics.

Adding their own view to the debate, Lambrou and Stockwell (2007, p. 3) contend that stylistics is a matter of describing "as systematically and openly as possible the nature of the textual evidence which accompanies the particular reading of the text". They further add that this basic outcome of stylistics provides a descriptive account of textual mechanics and the reading process which is made available in a common currency of register, in order to allow other stylisticians to compare their own account, verify or take issue with the analysis (Lambrou & Stockwell, 2007).

Scherre's (2001) analysis of the parallelism effect on phrase level demonstrates that parallel processing operates more efficiently when preceding markers are more similar. Specifically, if the immediately preceding markers are zeroes, the efficiency of this principle is enhanced (Scherre, 2001). As also claimed by Labov (1994, pp.547– 568), this effect does

not reveal “tendencies to preserve information”. Taking a more specific view, Jackendoff (2002) argues that idiomatic expressions may have irregular syntax, while having regular phonological and semantic structures. He rightly and insightfully points out that phonological combinations can also be idiomatic in that some occurring combinations may be highly unusual in the language. Also, many languages may have segments with very limited distribution. Later practitioners of language study tried to address limitations of Jackendoff’s conception. Language can’t be limited down to the use of idioms and phrasal verbs. Had it been the case, language would lose vivacity and lucidity.

Hulst (2004), has pointed out the particular hierarchical organization in a natural principle of all systems, i.e. physical, social and cognitive that produce infinite (or large) sets of expressions or constellations using finite means. The pedagogic implication of literary stylistics purports that stylistic analysis in general and linguistic parallelism in particular can be used as an effective tool for academic purposes. According to Collie and Slater (1990, p. 3), there are four main reasons which lead a language teacher to use literature in the classroom. These are valuable authentic material, cultural enrichment, language enrichment and personal involvement. Hişmanoğlu (2005) believes that literature provides readers with a different viewpoint towards language use by going beyond the known usages and rules of grammar, syntax and vocabulary.

The present study is unique because it goes beyond the language boundaries and is aimed at making a comparative study of linguistic parallelism in the literature of the two different languages, i.e. English and Urdu. To point out the basic differences in the underlying structures of these languages on one side, and the possible commonalities in the selection of words, the formation of phrases for deriving the same objectives on the other, are the main focuses of this research. This aspect of linguistic parallelism across the languages, therefore, stands out among the existing literature on the subject in the context of English and Urdu poetry.

## 2. Method

A comparative stylistic analysis of both the poems aiming at linguistic parallelism in word selection and formation of phrases is the underlying objective of this research. Both the poems are to be analyzed linguistically at first place. It will help the researchers to mark out and juxtapose phrases used in the two poems. Secondly, a comparative analysis is to be made in order to explore similarities and differences in them. No statistical data is to be collected. Thus, the use of statistical tools is not a part of this study.

## 3. Discussion results and analysis

This portion has been divided into three parts. The first part is making an intratextual analysis of the English poem, the second part is about the intratextual analysis of the Urdu poem and the third part is an attempt to make a comparative study of both the poems.

### 3.1 Intertextual analysis of the English ballad "La Belle Dam Sans Merci"

#### 3.1.1 Diction, tone and mood

If every running word is counted as a separate item, nearly one-third of the content-words in the poem are indisputably negative with respect to their connotative meaning. All such words, along with some relevant information, are enlisted below in tabular form:

Table 1. Textual locations, times of occurrence and implications

Words	Textual Location	Times of Occurrence	Associations/Implications
Ail	L.1, L.5	Two	ailment, discomfort, misery
Alone	L.2, L.46	Two	sorrow, lack of support, abandonment
palely/pale/death pale	L.2, L.37, L.38, L.46	Five	ailment, deterioration, death
Loitering	L.2, L.46	Two	discomfort
wither'd/withered	L.3, L.12, L.47	Three	deterioration, loss
Haggard	L.6	One	deterioration
Woe	L.6, L.34	Two	discomfort, misery
Anguish	L.10	One	discomfort, misery
Fever	L.10	One	ailment, discomfort
Fading	L.11	One	deterioration, loss
Wild	L.16, L.26, L.31	Four	lack of control
Strange	L.27	One	ambiguity, confusion
Wept	L.30	One	mourning, misery

sigh'd	L.30	One	pain, sorrow, loss, misery
Sore	L.30	One	sorrow, despair
Cold	L.36, L.44	Two	discomfort, hostility
Cried	L.39	One	mourning, misery
Thrall	L.40	One	sense of compulsion and imprisonment
Starved	L.41	One	deprivation
Gloom	L.41	One	darkness, despair
Horrid	L.42	One	hostility
Warning	L.42	One	impending danger

It can be easily deduced from the above table that overlapping semantic isotopes of disease, deterioration, and depression run throughout the body of the text, forming the general isotopy of misfortune. The table also shows that words with unpleasant or detestable associations have not just occurred but rather recurred in the ballad's text. Their recursion creates an interlocking sequence of negativity or an inescapable loop of misery or misfortune.

Moreover, in the third stanza, the inherent positive value of some words has been plagued by the negativity of their context. According to ordinary English usage, 'moist', as opposed to 'damp', has a positive connotation. Nonetheless, in L.10, its positive value is not just annulled but inverted by the immediately preceding phrase 'With anguish'. In the same line, 'dew' occurs not to suggest freshness but to cursor the curse of illness as it gets pre-modified by 'fever'. Rose obviously stands for attractiveness, and thus it is employed in poetry and elsewhere for describing appealing human appearance by the virtue of similitude. However, in L.11/L.12, the poem's internal norm of distorting or subverting positive semantic values are upheld and the pleasant associations of 'rose' are ripped off as it is sandwiched between two negative adjective participles, namely 'fading' and 'fast withered'. The choice of the lexis and its patterning signifies that the poem is wrought in a wistful tone or dejected voice.

Most of the concrete images projected by the painter-poet Keats in the first two stanzas may belong to the readers' script, or dynamic schema, of the autumn-winter transit period. Almost everybody's script of autumn has a slot for wilting or drooping plants. This slot is perfectly filled by the statement: 'The sedge has wither'd' (L.3). Passivity of birds is a part of the schematic conception of autumn because the lack of foliage adversely affects their activity. Moreover, the absence of birds usually belongs to the schematic conception of winters as they migrate to warmer regions to avoid frostiness. The verb phrase 'no birds sing' in L.4 has two implications: the relatively direct one is that the birds are passive and the extended one is that the birds are absent. So, the image conjured up by this phrase can conform either to the readers' general schema of autumn or to that of winters depending upon how they perceive it. For those people who have spent their lives close to Nature, the image depicted by the line 'The squirrel's granary is full' (L.7) is quite likely to take up a slot in the late-autumn's script because some animals make food reserves before the winters' arrival to guarantee sustenance during it when food sources become scarce. For those familiar with the rustic life, 'the harvest is done' (L.8) will certainly occupy a slot in the same script because autumn is traditionally considered as the main season of reaping grain from the crop-fields. Besides adding a picturesque or scenic quality to the poem, such imagery marks its mood with melancholic broodiness because neither autumn nor its successor, winter, has a positive connotation. Autumn has the emotive meaning of melancholy while winter has the connotation of hardship as it is the hardest season of the year.

### 3.1.2 Narrative Scheme

On the temporal axis, there are two deictic worlds: the world of the present and the world of the past. The shift from one temporal world to the other is marked by a change in the verb tense. L.1-12 refer to the 'now' of the text-world as indicated by the auxiliaries 'can', 'has' and 'is', and the main verbs 'sing' and 'see'. L.13-44 refer to the *then* of the text-world as indicated by the auxiliaries 'was', 'were' and 'could', and the main verbs 'met', 'made', 'looked', 'saw', 'found', 'said', 'took', 'wept', 'sigh'd', 'dream'd', 'cried' and 'awoke'. Then, in the subsequent four lines, that is from L.45-48, there is a return to the world of the present, indicated by the auxiliary 'is' and the main verb 'sojourn', both of which are marked for the present tense.

The poem opens up with a direct question which is repeated in the second stanza as well. Since the act of asking a question requires an addresser as its agent. Therefore, there is an implied first person in the first two stanzas. However, his presence becomes explicit as he takes the first person personal pronoun 'I' in the third stanza. On the internal time-scale of the text, he is confined to the present. Moreover, throughout the poem, he remains unnamed and unaddressed; no nominal or pronominal reference (besides the use of 'I' in L.9) has been made to him. This is suggestive of his peripheral status to the narrative. As opposed to him, the Knight's presence is extended to both the temporal zones—the zone of *now* and the zone of *then*. And, multiple times a reference has been made to him in the text as recorded in the table below:

Table 2. Reference words and their textual location

Reference Words	Textual Location
knight-at-arms	L.1, L.5
thee/thy	L.1, L.5.L.9, L.11
I/my/me	L.13, L.17, L.19, L.21, L.25, L.29, L.31, L.33, L.34, L.37, L.41, L.43, L.45

The fact that mostly first person references are made to him is indicative of his status as the principal narrator and point of view-character. The subsidiary narrating role of the unnamed inquiring voice and the pivotal narrating role of the Knight are also signified by the fact that the latter does not observe the Gricean maxim of quality in his speech: he gives a nine stanza long answer to the question posed by the first addresser in the first three stanzas. Moreover, the anonymous first narrator never makes any attempt of turn-taking or interruption while the second speaks on in a continuous flow. Thus, the narrative does not proceed as a dialogue between the two but as the Knight's monologue for the most part, and the first narrator is only inducted in the narrative scheme to introduce the Knight to the reader, and he retires as soon as his job is done.

### 3.1.3 What lies in the beloved's name?

'La Belle Dame sans Merci' (the title & L.39) is the only French phrase in an otherwise English poem. This textual exclusiveness of the nominal phrase mirrors the extraordinary nature of the entity it labels—the beloved. The poem is primarily meant for the English readership so, being linguistically foreign, the phrase also spins a cocoon of exoticness around the lady, and thus serves to somewhat alienate her from the reader. This impression of estrangement becomes bold when the adjective 'strange' modifies her language in L.27. Moreover, her French title and strange language, if taken in combination, can lead to the inference that she belongs to the French ethnicity. This raises her to a regal status because the narrative is set in the Post-Conquest England (see 4.x) where French was the language of the kings and the barons (Machan, 2003). The inferred notion of her noble standing is verified to some extent by the fact that she had once enthralled 'pale kings and princess'—both of which share the semantic feature /+royal/—who now admonish the knight of her entralling powers in a dream (L.37).

### 3.1.4 The undertone of death

The withered sedge in the first stanza, the harvest in the second, and the fading and fast withered rose in the third, all imply the termination of plant life which, in turn, implies mortality. Furthermore, all the men in the poem—the knight-at-arms, the kings and princes, and the warriors—are described as pale (see L.2, L.37 and L.38). Pale is the shared repulsive attribute of diseased people and corpses. Therefore, it also suggests mortality. The undertone of mortality becomes louder when, in L.38, the ultimate mortalizing agent, 'death' itself occurs to modify the modifier 'pale'. Hence, the resonance of Keats' characteristic preoccupation with death is found in his this work like many others.

### 3.1.5 Watching the poet twiddle with words

Perhaps, language repository is a toy-cupboard to every poet, and words are his most endeared plaything. Poets often employ conventional linguistic items in radical fashions. That is what the authors choose calling *the twiddling with words*. There are at least two instances of such twiddling in the ballad. The first occurs in L.7: 'The squirrel's granary is full'. Granary is a building or a room meant for storing threshed grain. And, of the usual course of things, human entities are the owners and keepers of granaries. However, in the line just stated, a little rodent—the squirrel—precedes the word 'granary' in the possessive case. On the textual level, this appears to be a linguistic curiosity resulting from the obvious infringement of a selection-restriction rule. However, on the discourse level, this noun phrase is potent of making perfect sense if one realizes that 'the squirrel' has taken the role of a granary-keeper in the poem's context because the behaviour of both is marked by the feature /+stocking/: the former buries nuts and seeds to last for the winters while the latter piles up grain indoor to protect it from the rough weather. Actually, the statement 'the squirrel's granary is full' expresses the guaranty of sustenance for the squirrel in the forthcoming winter season. This guaranty involves an indirect mockery of the non-facilitated state of the Knight who is 'alone and palely loitering' though the winter is around the corner. By treating the squirrel as a /+human/ entity, the poet is able to present it as an equal counterpart of the Knight in the survival contest, and thus mock his wrecked condition with more accentuation.

The second notable instance of the poet's toying with a linguistic norm occurs in L.35: 'The latest dream I ever dreamed'. 'Latest' usually collocates with terms like 'movie', 'song', 'album', 'hit', 'media release', 'press release', 'trend', 'news', and 'update'. Of course, it cannot be claimed that this is an exhaustive list of its collocations but one thing can be stated confidently that it hardly ever collocates with 'dream' in the conventional mode of discourse. This lexical deviation foregrounds the phrase, and thus invites the reader to look for a deeper underlying meaning. Actually, the word 'dream' is used here as a metonym for sleep. And, by collocating with 'latest', it evokes pity in the reader as it hints that the knight is suffering from insomnia since he saw a scary and disturbing dream in which phantoms of the lady's previous victims cautioned him against her inherent betraying quality.

### 3.2 Intertextual analysis of the Urdu poem "Husan ki Divy"

#### 3.2.1 The beloved's portrait

Here in this Urdu poem the graphic picture of the beloved has been given by constant references to the physical appearance of her charming personality. The noun phrase 'mae'y khane'y nigahoon' can be paraphrased as 'the alluring eyes' or 'the seductive eyes' but it literally means 'the dram shop eyes' or the 'barroom eyes'. The conceptual domain of the beloved's eyes has been juxtaposed to the conceptual domain of barroom because both share the features /+irresistible/ and /+inviting/. This is an elaboration of the conventional conceptual metaphor "Love and Addiction". In the same line, another figurative expression 'adaao ke taraane'y' occurs. In this case, the conceptual domain of gestures has been juxtaposed to the conceptual domain of minstrelsies to express that the lady's gestures have a unique absorbing quality and appealing nature which makes them analogous to softly sung music despite the fact that the former is a /-audible/ entity while the latter is a /+audible/ entity.

#### 3.2.2 The beloved's portrait

It is a common trend in poetry to express the overwhelming nature or the driving power of emotions by assigning /+human/ features to them. This trend is upheld in 1.27 of the Ghazal: 'chaldi woh kahin pyaar ko ruuta hua chhoora'. Here, the strength of the power of thwarted love to induce tears in the lover's eyes is uniquely expressed by presenting love itself as the agent of weeping.

#### 3.2.3 Betrayal as the end note

The poem, in the start, is a narration of love and passion duly supported by the graphic description of the beloved ravishing beauty. It is followed by recapitulating the good time spent together. The end note of the poem is an expression of betrayal which constitutes the sorry state of the lover and thus arise the deeply felt sympathies of the listeners.

#### 3.2.4 Narrative technique

This poem is a ballad which is basically narrating a love story in a sorrowful tone. Ballad is a subjective poem which narrates a short story in verse form. The story has been narrated in the first person pronoun which is making it highly subjective. The story has been narrated in the sequence of its occurrence. It has a proper plot and stages of development. The first three lines are written as an introduction to the story, where the refrain of the title line is used as a tool to make the theme more vivid and explicit. Lines 4 to 21 are written in the praise and adoration of the beloved. These lines are composed in such a way where the slow growth and development in the description of her beauty is observed. To make his description more emphatic, vivid and graphic, different Images are given. For example:

Line # 5: woh zulf k jis zulf se sharmain ghha^tain-----t

*The [pitch-black tress from which shies away all cloudiness*

Her black long hairs are compared with black clouds. Furthermore, her face has been compared with the sweet buds of flowers.

Line # 4: woh roop k jis roop se kalyaan bhi lajain

*The face from which the flower buds steal away [the essence of beauty]*

Her looks are given the names of sweet songs.

Line # 6: mae'y khane'y nigahoon pe, Adao ke taraane'y

*The minstrelsies of gestures over the luring eyes*

A clear shift in the narration can be seen in line #7. From this stage onward, the picture of surrounding and description of the nature has been given, where the poet talked about the moon, night and under the shade of a tree. The beautiful scene of Kashmir valley has been given which is really enhancing the effect and severity of the time. Here through the perfect support of suitable imagery the narration became more heightened and lucid. The final blow is given in the following line of the poem which indicates the peak or climax in the story plot.

Line # 19: Usne bhi kai baar mere baal sanwaree

*Many times she preened my hair*

Line # 20: Ehsaas ka, Jazbaat ka Ezhar hua tha

*Feelings and emotions were expressed*

From this point onward the downfall comes in the story of the poem and thus the tone of the poem changes from love to betrayal.

Line # 22 – 26: kuch rooz kate'y unhi bura waqt jab aya

*Some days were spent like this, and then came the bad times*

Us husn ki devi ne bhi nazroon ko pheraya-----*That nymph of Beauty turned away her eyes*

qurbat ne zamane ke nigahoon se giraya----- *[Her] intimacy belittled me in the sight of the contemporary world*

Anchal mere hatoon se muhabbat ne chhuraya-----*Adoration freed its fringe from my grasp*

Ek raat ko Usne mujhe suuta hua chhoora----*One night she abandoned me asleep*

The last line of the poem is in the form of a question in which the poet is asking a question from the unknown listener. Here at the end this question from the supposed listener is the proof of its being a perfect narrative.

Line # 32:   kia pyaar bhi daolat ka talabgaar hua tha  
*Had love also demanded material-wealth?*

### 3.2.5 Diction, mood and tone

The vocabulary used in the poem is in perfect harmony with the ongoing ideas and thought of the poem. Words are properly selected and nicely placed in the poem which is the key element of literature. There is a clear shift in the vocabulary according to the need of the poet. In the start, words of appreciation and applause are used as an experienced devotee and true worshiper of beauty. With a change in the flow of narrative, words get changed. At the end, words of frustrations and despair are used which is suggestive of tragic mood of the narrative. Basically, the poem is a narrative of the poet personal love experience with his beloved. Apparently it is an amusing and happy story of love and passion but inwardly it the nice blend of hummer and pathos. The start of the story is amusing and arise the curiosity in the listener/reader, but at the end it arises the sympathies of the reader/listener with the poet. It means the addressees laugh with the poet in the beginning but shed tears at the end.

### 3.3 Comparative analysis of the two poems

#### 3.3.1 The tale the title tells

The title of the Keats' ballad comprises solely of a noun phrase while Shevan Rizvi's lyric comprises of an independent clause which has an embedded noun phrase. A comparison between the two noun phrases, 'La Belle Dame Sans Merci' and 'Ek Husn ki Devi', can illustrate that both the titles have a common referent.

Table 3. Comparison of noun phrases

Determiner	Pre-Modifier	Head	Post-Modifier
La	Belle	Dame	Sans Merci
Ek	Husn ki	Divy	

A syntactic parallelism exists between the two with respect to the first three constituents, and only the additional fourth constituent, the post-modifier, in the former breaks this structural harmony.

Semantic equivalence is also observable. The determiner 'la' and 'ek' can be translated into English as 'the' and 'a' respectively. 'Belle' and 'husn', both, can be translated as 'feminine beauty/charm' or 'loveliness'. The headwords in the phrases need a finer analysis. They are identical in two aspects of meaning: denotative and connotative. They both denote a female adult human. They belong to the register of politeness, and thus have a positive social connotation. The French noun 'dame' is used when social regard or respect is intended. Likewise, the Sanskrit substantive 'Divy' is used to refer to a woman with a sense of civility. Both the poets could have opted for words having a neutral social value, such as 'femme' and 'naari' instead of 'dame' and 'Divy' respectively. Nonetheless, they preferred words having some courteous connotation to speak of their respective title figures in a courtly manner, and thus surround them with an air of superiority. Here, the choice of a single word indicates the poets' ideological point of view towards the beloved.

Now, the syntactically unparallelled part of the French noun phrase—Sans Merci—needs to undergo some semantic assessment. Its English equivalent would be 'without mercy' so it denotes apathy or even cruelty. Since, words can have multiple related significations, or, to put alternatively, they can exhibit polysemy. Therefore, besides being translatable as 'lady', the word 'divy' can also be translated as 'deity'. If the latter translation is picked up then it takes the connotation of aloofness or indifference. Hence, one thing is clearly signalled to the reader that the title figure of both the poems is not really good at heart; her beauty is just confined to the skin. This enables the reader to anticipate some tragic happening in the love narrative, rather than expecting a '*they lived happily ever after*' ending. So, this is how a single phrase or word in the title defines the mood of the whole poetic composition.

#### 3.3.2 How far the poet wants the reader to stand

Both the poets' intention is to keep the readers not close enough to question the credibility of the events nor far enough to remain untouched by the element of pathos in the poems.

The 'fairy's child' who is the principal or pivotal figure in John Keats' ballad and the 'elfin grot' which becomes the site for its most climatic, and thus significant, action, both, share the semantic feature /-real/ or /+imaginary/. Therefore, Keats might have felt the need to cause the willing suspension of disbelief in his readers. And, to meet this need, he has chosen the distancing technique; he has distanced the reader on the temporal axis by inducing some historical deviation in his work. In this regard, he has used archaic personal pronouns for the second person referent, such as 'thee' in L.1 and L.5, and 'thy' in L.10 and L.11. Both these pronouns belong to a diachronic variety of English, namely the Middle English, which was spoken from the end of the twelfth century till the end of the fifteenth century. So, their use enables him to set his plot in times as remote as the Middle Ages. During that epoch, English-French bilingualism prevailed in England as a consequence of the Norman Conquest, and the poet has cleverly inculcated even this subtle sociolinguistic

feature in his poem by choosing a French title. Moreover, the original concept of knights also belongs to the Medieval Europe, and the poem contains a knight as a principal human entity. This is a brief account of how Keats widens the reader-text gap on the temporal cline to render his highly romantic verse narrative plausible even for the men of logic. Nonetheless, in the final stanza (L.45), he employs the adverb of place ‘here’ to draw the reader as close as possible on the spatial axis. Probably, he opts for a drawing in technique at this point because he wants to incite pity and fear in the reader by letting him witness closely the ‘Alone and palely loitering’ knight-at-arms.

The poet of the Urdu lyric also manipulates the temporal and spatial point of view to achieve a desired impact on the reader. He sets the time of the narrative in the past by using the verb forms and auxiliaries which are marked for the past tense. However, in l.8 and l.9, he provides the reader some familiarity with the past world of the narrative by comparing the ‘here’ and ‘now’ of the frame narrative with the ‘there’ and ‘then’ of the actual narrative. Moreover, he asks a rhetorical question in l.32: ‘kia pyaar ki daolat ka talabgaar hua tha’. The act of posing a question always assumes an addressee so there is an implied second person here. And, as there are no characters present at the time of narrating besides the poetic speaker himself, the reader becomes the implied second person. Subsequently, the reader is somewhat familiarized with the poetic speaker, and thus he develops sympathy for him.

### 3.3.3 The beloved: A woman of supernatural beauty

The nominal phrase ‘Ek Husnki Devi’, which can be translated as ‘the nymph of Beauty’, serves as the opening phrase for the Urdu lyric, and then recurs no less than five times in l.3, l.13, l.21, l.33 and l.35. Its textual pervasiveness does not really allow the reader to overlook its significance even during an unabsorbed reading. The head-noun ‘nymph’ <divy> is a hyponym of supernatural beings. Therefore, by collocating with ‘beauty’ <husn>, it communicates the extraordinary character of the physical charms of the beloved. And, interestingly, its partial synonym, ‘fairy’s child’, occurs across the text boundary in the English ballad in L.14, in which, too, it is employed to suggest the supernatural degree of the beauté of la dame as it succeeds the phrase ‘Full beautiful’ as parenthetical detail.

### 3.3.4 Love: a fanciful deceit

Compare the beloved’s reported speech “I love thee true.” in L.28 of the English ballad with the assertion made by the poetic speaker in l.18 of the Urdu lyric: ‘Yak tarfana thee husn-o-muhabbat ke Esharee’ (The gestures of loveliness and affection were not unreciprocated). Through these lines, the reader learns that the admirer of La Belle Dame as well as that of the Husnki Devi claims that his lament is not for love unrequited. Rather, his torment is caused by being abandoned by the beloved who once had some fondness for him and reciprocated all his affection. However, it is worth investigating as to whether or not these claims are attested by the surrounding text.

There is hardly any unequivocal or unambiguous gesture of love made by the lady in either of the poems. In the Keats’ ballad, most of her love signs are nonverbal and/or informative rather than communicative, meaning thereby that they are not deliberately made to convey some specific information but some information might be inferred from them incidentally. (See the Table 04 below for the enumeration of the love gestures made by la belle dame.). Thus, there is some likelihood of misunderstanding or miscommunication.

Table 4. Enumeration of the love gestures made by la belle dame

Love Signals	Textual Location	Mode	Nature
She looked at me as she did love	L.19	nonverbal	Informative
[She] made sweet moan	L.20	vocal but nonverbal	Informative
[She would] sing a fairy’s song	L.24/L.25	Verbal	Informative
In language strange she said—“I love thee true.”	L.27/L.28	Verbal	Communicative

The first entry in the table ‘She looked at me as she did love’ refers to the narrator’s perception about which he is not very certain himself; the form word ‘as’ marks this line for weak epistemic modality. While interpreting the second and the third entry, it must be borne in mind that interpreting an informative signal, as opposed to a communicative one, often involves arbitrariness. Just as an interviewee’s shifting in the chair or a person’s tossing in the bed are generally taken as indicative of their nervousness and sleeplessness respectively but can mean something totally different as well, a lady’s making sweet moan and singing can be indicative of her being in love but there are not substantial proofs of such a state. Moreover, her song is pre-modified by the word ‘fairy’ which has the semantic component /-earthly/ or /-ordinary/; thus, there are little chances for the earth-bound knight to comprehend it. At first sight, the fourth and final love signal recorded in the table seems a good proof of the knight’s love being reciprocated by the beloved as it involves spoken language (note the use of the verb ‘said’ and the noun ‘language’), which is considered an efficient mode of getting the message across. However, there is a problem with this love signal as well: the noun ‘language’ is pre-modified by ‘strange’ so it gives the sense of unintelligibility, and makes the contemplative reader wonder how the knight could decode the lady’s love message when her language was unfamiliar or alien to him. This entails the probability that the lover merely assumed that the beloved said “I love thee true”. So, this is how a single attributive adjective, ‘strange’, casts doubts in the reader’s mind about the narrator’s reliability.

There are issues with the poetic speaker's claim about the mutual nature of his love affair in Israr Ahmad's poem just as there are in Keats' poem. In the *ghazal*, there are two lines which tell about some relatively obvious communicative activity between the poetic speaker and his charming mate, and involve the expression of love. The first is an adverbial clause: Eik pae<sup>r</sup> ke Sayae main jab Iqraar hua tha (When [love] was admitted under the shade of a tree) l.12. While, the latter is an independent declarative clause: Ehsaasv ka, Jazbaat ka Ezhar hua tha (Feelings and emotions were expressed) l.20. Being in the passive voice is the shared syntactic feature of the two. Choosing the passive construction over the active enables the poet to conceal the agent's identity, and thus adopt an ambiguous tone. This tone stirs the question in the reader's mind who expresses the sentiment of love—the poetic speaker, his beloved, or both. If it was only the poetic speaker then the lover's abandoning him in l.26 is not a bluff or betrayal on her part; rather, it is just his disillusionment from his own fanciful idea that the Husn ki Devi had a soft corner for him just as he had for her.

### 3.3.5 The element of subjectivity

Both the poems are highly subjective and saturated with the use of personal pronouns like 'I' and its case variants i.e. 'my' in possessive case and 'me' in objective case. In the same way, the Urdu *ghazal* is completely packed up with personal pronouns. These personal pronouns in Urdu language are 'Main' in the subjective case, 'Mera' in the possessive case and 'Mujay' in the objective case. The following table illustrates the usage and application of personal pronouns in both the poems as a proof of its high subjectivity.

Personal pronouns chart with reference to their number of occurrences in both the poems.

Table 5. personal pronouns in the two poems

Pronoun Case	English example	Number of Occurrence	Urdu Examples	Number of Occurrence
<b>Subjective Case</b>	I	12	Main	01
<b>Possessive Case</b>	My	01	Mera	03
<b>Objective Case</b>	Me	05	Mujay	09

### 3.3.6 A cult for physical beauty

Both the poetic speakers are found pining over the physical beauty of their respective beloveds even though being betrayed by them. Vocabulary related to lexical field of body and physic, i.e. hair, feet, eyes etc is commonly used in both the poems.

Table 6. A table of the expressions used for describing physical beauty in both the poems.

Supportive examples from English poem	Supportive examples from Urdu poem
Full beautiful—a fairy's child,	Ek Husn Ki Divy
Her hair was long,	Woh zulf k jis zulf se sharmain ghha <sup>^</sup> tain.
And her eyes were wild	mae'y khane <sup>^</sup> y nigahoon pe, Aadao ke taraane <sup>^</sup> y.

### 3.3.7 Love laden with passion for lust

In both the poems, there is a nice blend of love and lust. Lust, the concurrent theme of the poems, runs at the bottom of love stream. For example, sleep is used as a motif in both the poems to convey the theme of physical intimacy.

Line # 15 lamhaat muhabbat ke jahan hum ne guzaray  
*Where we spent the moments of adoration*

Line # 16 Angrae<sup>^</sup>yan le kar meri bahoon ke sahare  
*Yawning in my braces,*

Line # 19 Usne bhi kai baar mere baal sanwaree  
*Many times she preened my hair*

Line # 20 Ehsaas ka, Jazbaat ka Ezhar hua tha  
*Feelings and emotions were expressed*

In English poem also there is a nice description of the love expression:

And sure in language strange she said—  
“I love thee true.”

She took me to her elfin grot,  
 And there she wept, and sighed fill sore,  
 And there I shut her wild eyes  
 With kisses four.  
 And there she lulled me asleep,

### 3.3.8 Repetition of the title lines as a refrain

Refrain means the repetition of the same poetic line again and again in a poem. Here in both the poems the title lines are repeated regularly as a refrain. The title lines of the poems are suggestive of the underlying themes on one hand. For example, 'Aik Husanki Devi say mujay piyar howa ta' and 'La Belle Dame Sans Mercy' are indicative of the central theme. The repetition of the key lines here is suggestive of the miserable state of the narrators in the poems. They have been through some strange experience in their lives and now they are telling their experiences with the readers.

## 4. Conclusion

Linguistic parallelism, the tendency of using similar forms together within a continuous discourse, is a very strong linguistic phenomenon in literature. It is common in many languages around the globe. This research work demonstrates that "La Belle Dam Sans Merci" by John Keats and "Husan ki Divy" by Shevan Rizvi exhibit more similarities than differences with regard to this constraint. These two products of literary genius exhibit thematic affinity and formal congruity despite their production in regions separated by miles of land and water, in cultures lacking any shared values, and in languages having no common ancestry. A detailed linguistic analysis of both the poems was presented. The two poems not only exhibit stylistic equivalence that is they are written in the same style and manner but they bear thematic unity also.

## References

- Anderson, J. M. (1992). *Linguistic Representation: Structural Analogy and Stratification*. Berlin: Mouton de Gruyter.
- Anderson, J. M. (2006). Structural analogy and universal grammar. *Lingua*. 116, 601–633. DOI: 10.1016/j.lingua.2004.08.013
- Collie, J. and S. Slater. (1990). *Literature in the Language Classroom: A Resource Book of Ideas and Activities*. Cambridge: CUP.
- Fish, S. E. (1981). What is stylistics and why are they saying such terrible things about it? Freeman, D.C (Ed) (1981) *Essays in modern stylistics*. London: Methuen & Co Ltd. (pp. 53-74)
- Fowler, R. (1996). *Linguistic Criticism*. (2<sup>nd</sup>ed.). London: Oxford University Press.
- Halliday, M. A. K. (1996). *Descriptive Linguistics in Literary Studies*. UK: Longman Press.
- Hişmanoğlu, M. (2005). Teaching English Through Literature. *Journal of Language and Linguistic Studies*. Vol.1, No.1, April 2005.
- Hulst, H.G. (2004). Phonological dialectics: A short history of generative phonology. In P.G.J. van Sterkenburg (ed.). *Linguistics today – Facing a greater challenge*. Amsterdam: John Benjamins Publishing Company, 217-243.
- Jackendoff, R., (2002). *Foundations of Language: Brain, Meaning, Grammar, Evolution*. Oxford: Oxford University Press
- Kiparsky, P., (1978). *Recent developments in generative phonology*. In: Weinstock, J. (ed.), *The Nordic Languages and Modern Linguistics*, vol. 3. University of Texas, Austin, TX, pp. 42–50.
- Labov, W. (1994). The functional character of change. In *Principles of linguistic change: Internal factors*. Cambridge: Blackwell. pp. 545–599.
- Lambrou, M. & Stockwell, P. (2007). *Contemporary Stylistics*. New York: Maiden Lane.
- Machan, T. W. (2003). *English in Middle Ages*. New York: Oxford University Press.
- Sankoff, D. (1978). *Linguistic Variation: Models and Methods*. New York: Academic Press.
- Scherre, M. & Marta, P. (2001). Phrase-level parallelism effect on noun phrase number agreement. *Language Variation and Change*. 13. 91-107.
- Simpson, P. (1997). *Language through literature: An introduction*. London: Routledge
- Thorne, J. P. (1970). Generative grammar and stylistic analysis. In J. Lyons (ed.), *New Horizons in Linguistics*. Harmondsworth: Penguin
- Widdowson, H. G. (1988). *Stylistics and the teaching of Literature*. Hong Kong, UK: Longman Press.

**Appendix****Transliteration and translation of the Urdu Ghazal “Husan ki Divy” by Shevan Rizvi**

Ek Husn Ki Devi se mujhe pyaar hua tha, hay pyaar hua tha

*I had fallen in love with a nymph of Beauty; hey! I had fallen in love*

Ek Husn Ki Devi se mujhe pyaar hua tha, hay pyaar hua tha

*I had fallen in love with a nymph of Beauty; hey! I had fallen in love*

dil uski mohabat main giraftaar hua tha

*[My] heart was captured by her adoration*

Ek Husn Ki Devi se mujhe pyaar hua tha, hay pyaar hua tha

*I had fallen in love with a nymph of Beauty; hey! I had fallen in love*

woh roop k jis roop se kalyaan bhi lajain

*The face from which the flower buds steal away [the essence of beauty]*

woh zulf k jis zulf se sharmain ghha^tain

*The [pitch-black] tress from which shies away all cloudiness*

mae^y khane^y nigahoon pe, Aadao ke taraane^y

*The minstrelsies of gestures over the luring eyes*

da^y daale mujhe husn-o-mohabbat ke khazane

*[She] endowed me with the treasures of beauty and love*

Haan Aisi he Eik Raat thi

*Yes, indeed, that was a night like this one*

Ayasa he sama tha

*The imagery was not very different [either]*

Yeh Chand bhi puura tha

*The moon was also in full bloom*

Zamana bhi jawan tha

*The era was vibrant*

Eik pae^r ke Sayae main jab Iqraar hua tha

*When love was admitted under the shade of a tree*

Ek Husn Ki Devi se mujhe pyaar hua tha.hay pyaar hua tha

*I had fallen in love with a nymph of Beauty; hey! I had fallen in love*

kashmeer ki waadi ke woh purr qaif nazare

*Those sedative scenes of the vale of Kashmir*

lamhaat muhabbat ke jahan hum ne guzaray

*Where we spent the moments of adoration*

Angrae^yan le kar meri bahoon ke sahare

*Yawning in my braces,*

gul naar nazar ate thay woh sharam ke maree

*She used to blush scarlet*

Yak tarfa na thee husn-o-muhabbat ke Esharee

*The gestures of loveliness and affection were not unreciprocated*

Usne bhi kai baar mere baal sanwaree

*Many times she preened my hair*

Ehsaas ka, Jazbaat ka Ezhar hua tha

*Feelings and emotions were expressed*

Ek Husn Ki Devi se mujhe pyaar hua tha, hay pyaar hua tha

*I had fallen in love with a nymph of Beauty; hey! I had fallen in love*

kuch rooz kate^y unhi bura waqt jab aya

*Some days were spent like this, and then came the bad times*

Us husn ki devi ne bhi nazroon ko pheraya  
*That nymph of Beauty turned away her eyes*  
 qurbaat ne zamane ke nigahoon se giraya  
*[Her] intimacy belittled me in the sight of the contemporary world*  
 Anchal mere haton se muhabbat ne chhuraya  
*Adoration freed its fringe from my grasp*  
 Ek raat ko Usne mujhe suuta hua chhoora  
*One night she abandoned me asleep*  
 chaldi woh kahin pyaar ko ruuta hua chhoora  
*She walked away; [she] left love weeping*  
 soya hua main neend se jaga ju saware  
*When I woke up early from the slumber*  
 woh jab na milii chhagaye ankhoon main andhere  
*When I couldn't find her around, bleakness was cast over my eyes*  
 taqdeer kisi ko bhi bure din na dekhae^y  
*May destiny never keep in its store such hard days for anyone*  
 hote^y hain bure^y waqt main Apne bhi paraye  
*Even acquaintances turn out to be strangers in hard times*  
 kia pyaar bhi daulat ka talabgaar hua tha  
*Had love also demanded material-wealth?*  
 Ek Husn Ki Devi se mujhe pyaar hua tha, hay pyaar hua tha  
*I had fallen in love with a nymph of Beauty; hey! I had fallen in love*  
 dil uski mohabat main giraftaar hua tha  
*[My] heart was captured by her adoration*  
 Ek Husn Ki Devi se mujhe pyaar hua tha, hay pyaar hua tha  
*I had fallen in love with a nymph of Beauty; hey! I had fallen in love*